Dogmatic Criticism towards the Need of Religion: An Islamic Response

Dr. Tahir Masood Qazi
HOD/ Associate Professor, Department of Islamic Studies, Lahore Garrison University, Lahore

Hafiz Muhammad Hamid
Doctoral Candidate, Department of Islamic Studies, Lahore Garrison University, Lahore

Nayab Gul
Doctoral Candidate, Department of Islamic Studies, Lahore Garrison University, Lahore

Abstract
This analytical study delves into the subject of dogmatic criticism concerning the necessity of religion, focusing specifically on Islam's response. It aims to explore the various dimensions of dogmatic criticism and its impact on religious belief systems, particularly within the context of Islam. The study also seeks to examine Islam's multifaceted responses to these critiques. By analyzing the interplay between dogmatic criticism and Islam's response, this study aims to shed light on the complexities surrounding the need for religion in contemporary society.

Key Words: Dogmatic Criticism, Need of Religion, Islamic Response

Introduction
Critics argue that religious dogma can stifle critical thinking and discourage questioning or challenging established beliefs. Dogmatic adherence to religious doctrines may discourage individuals from seeking alternative perspectives, exploring diverse ideas, or engaging in intellectual discourse.
Dogmatic Criticism towards the Need of Religion: An Islamic Response

This limitation can hinder the development of new knowledge, scientific advancements, and the pursuit of truth through rational inquiry. Here are some references that discuss the argument that religious dogma can stifle critical thinking and discourage questioning or challenging established beliefs:

Richard Dawkins, a prominent atheist and evolutionary biologist, argues that religious dogma inhibits critical thinking and hinders scientific progress by discouraging open inquiry and skepticism. Sam Harris examines the negative consequences of religious dogma and argues that uncritical adherence to religious beliefs stifles intellectual curiosity and inhibits the pursuit of truth. Christopher Hitchens explores the detrimental effects of religious dogma on critical thinking, intellectual discourse, and the development of new knowledge. He suggests that religious beliefs can impede progress and rational inquiry.

Bertrand Russell presents his critique of religious dogma, arguing that it restricts intellectual freedom and discourages individuals from questioning established beliefs. He emphasizes the importance of critical thinking and rational inquiry. Daniel Dennett discusses the harmful effects of religious dogma on critical thinking and the exploration of diverse ideas. He suggests that breaking free from dogmatic adherence is essential for intellectual growth and the pursuit of truth.

These references offer various perspectives on how religious dogma can potentially hinder critical thinking, exploration of new ideas, and the pursuit of truth through rational inquiry.

Islam Embraces Intellectual Diversity

Islam, as a religion, promotes intellectual curiosity, critical thinking, and the pursuit of knowledge. It does not discourage individuals from seeking alternative perspectives, exploring diverse ideas, or engaging in intellectual discourse. The Quran, the central religious text of Islam, encourages believers to reflect upon the world around them and to seek understanding through observation and contemplation.

In several verses of the Quran, Muslims are urged to ponder upon the signs of creation and to use their intellect in order to comprehend the world. For instance, in Holy Quran, Surah Al-Baqarah, it states: "Indeed, in the
creation of the heavens and the earth and the alternation of the night and the
day are signs for those of understanding." This verse highlights the
importance of observing the natural world and using one's intellect to
recognize the signs of God's creation.

Islamic history also provides numerous examples of scholars and thinkers
who actively engaged in intellectual discourse, welcomed different viewpoints,
and promoted knowledge acquisition. During the Islamic Golden Age, which
spanned from the 8th to the 14th centuries, Muslim scholars made significant
contributions to various fields including mathematics, astronomy, medicine,
philosophy, and literature. This period witnessed the establishment of
renowned institutions such as the House of Wisdom (Bayt al-Hikmah) in
Baghdad, where scholars from different cultures and backgrounds
collaborated and exchanged ideas. Furthermore, Islam encourages believers to
seek knowledge from diverse sources and to engage with people of different
backgrounds. The Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) emphasized the
importance of seeking knowledge throughout his life and encouraged his
companions to learn from different communities. His companions, known as
the Sahaba, would travel great distances to acquire knowledge from various
scholars, even if they belonged to different religious or cultural backgrounds.

Moreover, Islam encourages dialogue and debate as a means of intellectual
growth and understanding. The Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him)
engaged in numerous discussions with people from different faiths, including
Jews, Christians, and polytheists. These interactions fostered an environment
of intellectual exchange, where ideas were presented, analyzed, and debated.

In summary, Islam does not discourage individuals from seeking alternative
perspectives, exploring diverse ideas, or engaging in intellectual discourse. On
the contrary, it promotes critical thinking, the pursuit of knowledge, and
encourages believers to reflect upon the signs of creation. Islamic history
provides examples of scholars who actively engaged in intellectual discourse,
and the Prophet Muhammad himself encouraged dialogue and debate. It is
through open-mindedness, curiosity, and intellectual exploration that
Muslims can deepen their understanding of the world and their faith.
Conflict with Scientific Knowledge

Another point of contention is the perceived conflict between religious dogma and scientific knowledge. Critics argue that certain religious teachings, such as creationism or denial of evolution, contradict well-established scientific theories. This conflict fuels the perception that religious beliefs are incompatible with empirical evidence and the principles of scientific inquiry, potentially undermining public trust in religious institutions. Following references discuss the conflict between certain religious teachings and well-established scientific theories:

Science, religion, and society: An encyclopedia of history, culture, and controversy, explores the relationship between science, religion, and society. It contains various entries that discuss the conflicts between certain religious teachings, such as creationism or denial of evolution, and well-established scientific theories. It also explores how these conflicts can contribute to the perception that religious beliefs are incompatible with empirical evidence and scientific principles, potentially leading to a decline in public trust in religious.10

Science, Evolution, and Creationism is a book by the National Academies provides an overview of the scientific evidence supporting evolution and discusses the conflict between religious beliefs, such as creationism, and the scientific understanding of the origins of life.11

A Pew Research Center about religion and science report examines the relationship between religion and science, including the perspectives of religious groups on topics such as evolution, climate change, and medical advancements.12 “Why Evolution is true” presents the evidence for evolution and addresses common misconceptions and conflicts with religious beliefs.13

These references provide various perspectives on the conflict between religious teachings, such as creationism or the denial of evolution, and well-established scientific theories. They discuss the potential impact of this conflict on public trust in religious institutions and the perception that religious beliefs may be incompatible with empirical evidence and the principles of scientific inquiry.

Islam and Science Compatibility
Islam, like many other major religions, offers a comprehensive worldview that encompasses both spiritual and practical aspects of human life. While religious beliefs are often seen as matters of faith, it is essential to recognize that Islam has a long history of engaging with knowledge and embracing scientific inquiry.

**a. Quranic Encouragement for Seeking Knowledge**

The Quran, the central religious text of Islam, repeatedly emphasizes the importance of knowledge and encourages believers to observe and reflect upon the natural world. Verses such as "Will they not then ponder on the Quran" If it had been from other than Allah, they would have found therein much incongruity highlight the invitation to explore and engage with the world to find coherence and understanding.

**b. Islamic Scholars as Pioneers of Scientific Inquiry**

Historically, Islamic civilization has produced numerous scholars who made significant contributions to various scientific disciplines. Scholars such as Ibn al-Haytham, Al-Zahrawi, Al-Khwarizmi, and Ibn Sina played pivotal roles in advancing mathematics, astronomy, medicine, and other fields. These contributions demonstrate a harmonious relationship between Islamic beliefs and scientific endeavors.

**c. Complementarity between Science and Islam**

Islam recognizes that science and religion address different aspects of human existence. Science focuses on the empirical investigation of the natural world, while religion provides guidance in matters of spirituality, ethics, and purpose. Many Islamic scholars and theologians argue that both domains complement each other, as they deal with different dimensions of human life and offer distinct perspectives.

**d. Compatibility of Islamic Teachings with Scientific Findings**

Islamic beliefs are not inherently in conflict with empirical evidence. Many scientific discoveries align with the principles and teachings of Islam. For instance, the Quran refers to the universe's creation and expansion, which is consistent with the Big Bang theory. Additionally, the Quran emphasizes the
unity and interconnectedness of all living things, a notion that resonates with modern ecological and biological understanding.\textsuperscript{18}

e. Ethical Framework
Islam encourages ethical conduct and responsible use of knowledge. Islamic principles emphasize the preservation of life, justice, compassion, and stewardship of the Earth. These values align with the principles of scientific inquiry, which emphasize intellectual integrity, honesty, and responsible use of knowledge for the betterment of society.\textsuperscript{19}

While there may be instances where religious interpretations and scientific findings appear to conflict, it is essential to approach such discussions with nuance and a recognition of the limitations of human understanding. Islam, as a dynamic and multifaceted religion, encourages believers to seek knowledge, reflect upon the natural world, and reconcile apparent conflicts through intellectual engagement.\textsuperscript{20}

Resistance to Change
Dogma often resists adaptation to changing social, cultural, and ethical norms. Critics argue that rigid adherence to religious teachings can impede societal progress by inhibiting the acceptance of new ideas, social justice, and inclusivity. Religious dogma may maintain outdated or discriminatory practices, such as the subordination of women or resistance to scientific advancements in areas such as reproductive health or genetic research.

The references which discuss the arguments made by critics regarding the potential negative effects of rigid adherence to religious teachings on societal progress are following:
Haque A.U. in his article about the tension between religion and progress, examining how rigid adherence to religious teachings can hinder societal progress and inhibit the acceptance of new ideas.\textsuperscript{21} Philosopher Daniel C. Dennett examines the social impact of religious dogma, arguing that it can impede progress by maintaining outdated practices and inhibiting critical thinking.\textsuperscript{22}

Christopher Hitchens offers a critical perspective on religion, arguing that its rigid adherence to dogma can hinder social progress, including issues related
to women's rights and scientific advancements. The book “Religion and the Human Future: An Essay on Theological Humanism” delves into the relationship between religion and progress, discussing how rigid adherence to religious teachings can hinder inclusivity, social justice, and acceptance of new ideas. The “Other Islamic Reformation: Rethinking Modernity, Pluralism, and Secularism” is a research work specifically addresses the impact of rigid religious teachings on societal progress within Islam, discussing how religious dogma can impede social justice, inclusivity, and acceptance of new ideas.

These references provide insights into the arguments made by critics about how adherence to religious teachings can potentially hinder societal progress, limit acceptance of new ideas, and impede social justice and inclusivity.

Islam's Progressive Stance
Islam, as a religion, is rooted in principles that promote justice, equality, and intellectual curiosity. While there may be instances where cultural practices or misinterpretations have led to discriminatory attitudes or resistance to certain scientific advancements, it is important to differentiate between these cultural practices and the core teachings of Islam itself. Holy Quran states that believers should stand firmly for justice, even if it goes against their own interests or those of their relatives. Regarding equality, Islam teaches that all individuals are equal before God, regardless of their race, ethnicity, or social status. The Quran emphasizes that the most honorable among believers are those who are righteous, not those who possess wealth or power. Furthermore, Islam encourages intellectual curiosity and the pursuit of knowledge. The Quran repeatedly urges believers to reflect upon the signs of God's creation and to seek knowledge and wisdom. Muslims are encouraged to observe and explore the natural world as a means of recognizing God's wisdom and increasing their understanding.

Islam holds that men and women are equal in their humanity and share the same fundamental rights and responsibilities. The Quran, the central religious text of Islam, emphasizes the inherent worth and dignity of all human beings, regardless of their gender. It recognizes and acknowledges the individual talents, capabilities, and contributions of women in society. Islamic teachings
advocate for justice, fairness, and the empowerment of women in all spheres of life, including education, work, marriage, and inheritance. There are numerous examples from Islamic history that highlight the involvement and contributions of women in various fields, such as scholarship, governance, and business. Prominent female figures, such as Aisha bint Abu Bakr, who was a scholar and advisor, and Fatima al-Fihri, who founded the world's oldest existing degree-granting university, the University of Al Quaraouiyine in Morocco, exemplify the important roles women have played throughout Islamic civilization. Regarding scientific advancements, Islam does not inherently discourage or resist progress in any field, including reproductive health or genetic research. Islamic teachings encourage believers to seek knowledge and understanding of the natural world. The Quran itself encourages observation, reflection, and exploration of the universe as signs of God's creation. Islamic history is replete with examples of Muslim scholars who made significant contributions to various scientific disciplines, such as astronomy, medicine, mathematics, and optics.

It is important to recognize that any resistance to scientific advancements or discriminatory practices found in some Muslim-majority societies is often influenced by cultural, social, or political factors rather than the religious dogma itself. Cultural practices and traditional beliefs can sometimes be conflated with religious teachings, leading to misconceptions and misinterpretations. It is crucial to approach the study of Islam and its practices with nuance and recognition of the diversity of interpretations within the religion.

**Influence on Public Policy**

The impact of religious dogma on public policy decisions is another concern. Critics argue that when religious beliefs strongly influence policymaking, it may lead to the imposition of religious values on a diverse society, potentially infringing upon the rights and freedoms of individuals who do not share those beliefs. This conflict between religious dogma and secular governance raises questions about the appropriate role of religion in shaping public policies.
Some references which discuss the arguments made by critics regarding the potential conflicts between religious beliefs and policymaking are as:

The book “Religion and Secularism in the European Union: State of Affairs and Current Debates” examines the relationship between religion and secularism in the European Union. It includes chapters that discuss the challenges posed by religious influence on policymaking and the potential infringement of individual rights in a diverse society. An author explores the tensions between religious values and liberal constitutionalism. He addresses the arguments made by critics who argue that the imposition of religious values through policymaking can undermine the principles of liberal democracy and restrict the rights and freedoms of individuals.

Sager, R. discusses the constitutional protection of religious freedom and its interaction with public policies. He explores the potential conflicts that arise when religious beliefs strongly influence policymaking, leading to the imposition of religious values on a diverse society and the resulting implications for individual rights and freedoms.

Monsma, S. V. focuses on the role of religious nonprofit organizations in the provision of public services. Author discusses the challenges and controversies associated with the involvement of religious organizations in policymaking and the potential conflicts between religious values and secular governance.

These references should provide us with some valuable insights and perspectives on the arguments raised by critics concerning the influence of religious beliefs on policymaking and its impact on individual rights and freedoms in a diverse society.

**Islam and Diverse Society**

Islam, as a major world religion, encompasses a rich and diverse set of beliefs, practices, and interpretations. While some individuals and groups may interpret and practice Islam in ways that are more restrictive or impose their religious values on others, it is important to understand that such actions are not inherent to the religion itself. Islam, when understood in its true essence, promotes principles of tolerance, coexistence, and respect for the rights and
freedoms of all individuals, regardless of their religious beliefs. One of the key foundations of Islam is the principle of free will and individual choice. The Quran, the holy book of Islam, emphasizes that there is no compulsion in religion, indicating that each individual has the freedom to choose their own religious beliefs and practices. This principle reinforces the idea that Islam does not seek to impose its values on others, but rather encourages peaceful coexistence and dialogue among people of different faiths.

Furthermore, Islamic teachings emphasize the importance of justice, equality, and respect for human rights. The Quran states that all human beings are equal in the sight of God and that individuals should be judged based on their character and actions, rather than their religious affiliation. These teachings provide a strong foundation for the protection of individual rights and freedoms, irrespective of religious beliefs.

Historically, Islamic societies have demonstrated a remarkable level of religious pluralism and coexistence. During the Islamic Golden Age, which spanned several centuries, Muslim scholars, scientists, and intellectuals made significant contributions to various fields of knowledge, while fostering an atmosphere of religious tolerance and cultural exchange. This period stands as a testament to the compatibility of Islam with diverse societies and the flourishing of intellectual pursuits.

Moreover, contemporary examples of Muslim-majority countries, such as Indonesia, Malaysia, and Turkey, showcase the coexistence of diverse religious communities and the protection of individual freedoms. These countries have legal systems that ensure the rights of religious minorities and guarantee religious freedom for all citizens, thereby dispelling the misconception that Islam inherently imposes its religious values on society. It is crucial to recognize that the actions of a few individuals or groups who may interpret Islam in a restrictive or oppressive manner do not represent the entirety of the religion or its followers. The vast majority of Muslims worldwide embrace the principles of tolerance, respect, and peaceful coexistence with people of different faiths. In conclusion, Islam, when understood in its true essence and teachings, does not lead to the imposition
of its religious values on a diverse society. The religion emphasizes the importance of individual freedom, respect for human rights, and coexistence with people of different beliefs. It is essential to distinguish between the actions of a minority and the true teachings of Islam when discussing its compatibility with diverse societies and the preservation of individual rights and freedoms.

**Reinforcement of Superstition**

Critics contend that religious practices and rituals often rely on superstition, reinforcing beliefs in supernatural causality and magical thinking. These practices may perpetuate irrational beliefs and behaviors, diverting attention from evidence-based explanations and scientific understanding. This criticism emphasizes the importance of promoting rationality and critical thinking as essential foundations for societal progress. Here are some references that discuss the critics' contention regarding religious practices and rituals relying on superstition and reinforcing beliefs in supernatural causality and magical thinking:

Richard Dawkins, a prominent atheist and evolutionary biologist, criticizes religious practices and argues that they are based on superstition and magical thinking.38

Sam Harris, a neuroscientist and philosopher, examines the dangers of religious beliefs and criticizes the reliance on supernatural causality and irrational thinking in religious practices.39

Daniel Dennett, a philosopher and cognitive scientist, explores the psychological and cultural origins of religious beliefs and criticizes the perpetuation of irrational beliefs and behaviors through religious rituals.40

Michael Shermer, a science writer and skeptic, discusses various instances of irrational beliefs and superstitions, including religious practices, and highlights the need for evidence-based thinking and scientific understanding.41

Dan Barker, a former evangelical preacher, shares his journey from religious belief to atheism and criticizes the reliance on supernatural causality and magical thinking in religious practices.42

45
These references provide different perspectives and arguments against religious practices and rituals that are perceived to perpetuate superstition, reinforce beliefs in the supernatural, and divert attention from evidence-based explanations and scientific understanding.

**Islam: Rationality and Progress**

Islam, as a religion, places great importance on the promotion of rationality and critical thinking as essential foundations for societal progress. The teachings of Islam encourage believers to engage in thoughtful reflection, intellectual inquiry, and the pursuit of knowledge. This emphasis on reason and critical thinking can be found in various aspects of Islamic scripture, history, and scholarly tradition.

**a. Quranic Teachings**

The Quran, the central religious text of Islam, repeatedly urges believers to ponder, reflect, and think critically. Verses such as "So travel through the land and observe how He began creation"\(^43\) and "Indeed, in the creation of the heavens and the earth and the alternation of the night and the day are signs for those of understanding"\(^44\) encourage Muslims to observe the world around them, explore natural phenomena, and seek knowledge through observation and reflection.

**b. Seeking Knowledge**

Islamic tradition places a strong emphasis on seeking knowledge as a religious obligation. The famous saying of the Prophet Muhammad, "Seeking knowledge is obligatory upon every Muslim," highlights the importance of education and intellectual growth. Islamic scholars throughout history have contributed significantly to various fields, including mathematics, astronomy, medicine, philosophy, and literature, fostering a tradition of critical thinking and rationality.\(^45\)

**c. Islamic Philosophy**

Islamic philosophy, particularly during the Golden Age of Islam, flourished with an emphasis on rationality and critical thinking. Scholars like Al-Kindi, Al-Farabi, Ibn Sina (Avicenna), and Ibn Rushd (Averroes) synthesized classical Greek philosophy with Islamic theology, emphasizing the
compatibility between reason and faith. These scholars promoted rational inquiry and critical analysis, developing a tradition of Islamic philosophy that contributed to advancements in various intellectual disciplines.46

d. Ijtihad and Independent Reasoning
Islam encourages its followers to engage in ijtihad, which refers to independent reasoning and critical thinking. Ijtihad allows scholars to interpret and apply Islamic principles to contemporary issues, taking into account societal advancements and changing circumstances. This concept fosters a culture of intellectual engagement, critical examination, and adaptability, promoting societal progress through reasoned approaches to complex challenges.47

e. Ethical Considerations
Islam emphasizes ethical behavior and moral responsibility. The Quran encourages believers to think critically about the consequences of their actions, weigh alternatives, and make informed decisions based on reason and wisdom. Ethical considerations, along with critical thinking, are essential for shaping just and equitable societies that promote the well-being of all individuals. In conclusion, Islam places a strong emphasis on promoting rationality and critical thinking as essential foundations for societal progress. The teachings of the Quran, the tradition of seeking knowledge, the contributions of Islamic philosophers, the practice of ijtihad, and ethical considerations all reflect Islam's commitment to intellectual engagement, thoughtful reflection, and the pursuit of knowledge. By encouraging believers to think critically and apply reason, Islam seeks to create societies that are intellectually vibrant, socially just, and conducive to human progress.

Conclusion
Criticism of dogma and superstition raises serious concerns regarding the need and importance of Religion in contemporary society. The perceived limitations on critical thinking, conflicts with scientific knowledge, resistance to change, influence on public policy, and reinforcement of superstition pose challenges to the relevance and credibility of religious teachings. Addressing these concerns requires an open and inclusive approach that encourages
dialogue, encourages critical thinking, and promotes the compatibility of religious beliefs with scientific understanding and societal progress. Islam does not discourage individuals from seeking alternative perspectives, exploring diverse ideas, or engaging in intellectual discourse. On the contrary, it promotes critical thinking, the pursuit of knowledge, and encourages believers to reflect upon the signs of creation. Islamic history provides examples of scholars who actively engaged in intellectual discourse, and the Prophet Muhammad himself encouraged dialogue and debate. It is through open-mindedness, curiosity, and intellectual exploration that Muslims can deepen their understanding of the world and their faith.

Islamic beliefs are not inherently in conflict with empirical evidence. Many scientific discoveries align with the principles and teachings of Islam. Islam, as a dynamic and multifaceted religion, encourages believers to seek knowledge, reflect upon the natural world, and reconcile apparent conflicts through intellectual engagement. The religious dogma of Islam does not maintain outdated or discriminatory practices such as the subordination of women or resistance to scientific advancement in areas such as reproductive health or genetic research. Islam, as a religion, is rooted in principles that promote justice, equality, and intellectual curiosity. The vast majority of Muslims worldwide embrace the principles of tolerance, respect, and peaceful coexistence with people of different faiths. It is essential to distinguish between the actions of a minority and the true teachings of Islam when discussing its compatibility with diverse societies and the preservation of individual rights and freedoms. Islam places a strong emphasis on promoting rationality and critical thinking as essential foundations for societal progress. By encouraging believers to think critically and apply reason, Islam seeks to create societies that are intellectually vibrant, socially just, and conducive to human progress.

References


6 Al-Baqarah 2:164.


14 Al-Nisā‘ 4:82.


17 Al-Amriyā 21:30, Al-Zari Yat 51:47.


22 Dennett, *Breaking the Spell: Religion as a Natural Phenomenon*, 75.


Dogmatic Criticism towards the Need of Religion: An Islamic Response

34 Al-Baqarah 2:256.
37 Alkhateeb, *Lost Islamic History: Reclaiming Muslim Civilization from the Past*, 151-172.
40 Dennett, *Breaking the Spell: Religion as a Natural Phenomenon*, 75.
43 Al-ʻAnkabūt 29:20.
44 Al-ʻImrān 3:190.